

## Policies of Tajikistan and Uzbekistan toward Afghanistan



**Azamjon Isabaev**

**Policies of Tajikistan and  
Uzbekistan toward Afghanistan**

*Common Structures, Varying Outcomes  
(1991-2014)*

Bibliografische Informationen der Deutschen Nationalbibliothek

Die Deutsche Nationalbibliothek verzeichnet diese Publikation in der Deutschen Nationalbibliografie; detaillierte bibliografische Daten sind im Internet über <http://dnb.ddb.de> abrufbar

Zugl.: Hamburg, Univ., Diss., 2018

ISBN 978-3-96138-197-5

© 2020 Wissenschaftlicher Verlag Berlin

Olaf Gaudig & Peter Veit GbR

[www.wvberlin.de](http://www.wvberlin.de) / [www.wvberlin.com](http://www.wvberlin.com)

Alle Rechte vorbehalten.

Dieses Werk ist urheberrechtlich geschützt.

Jede Verwertung, auch einzelner Teile, ist ohne Zustimmung des Verlages unzulässig. Dies gilt insbesondere für fotomechanische Vervielfältigung sowie Übernahme und Verarbeitung in EDV-Systemen.

Druck und Bindung: SDL – Digitaler Buchdruck, Berlin

Printed in Germany

€ 56,00

TO MY FATHER



# Contents

- Acknowledgements ..... 10
- List of tables and maps..... 12
- List of abbreviations..... 13
- 1. Introduction ..... 15**
  - 1.1 The research question..... 18
  - 1.2 State of research and relevance of a “heterodox” perspective ..... 19
  - 1.3 Theoretical frameworks..... 25
  - 1.4 Methodology ..... 27
  - 1.5 Structure of the thesis..... 29
- 2. Theoretical frameworks..... 31**
  - 2.1 Scientific “spirit” of this study ..... 31
  - 2.2 Neoclassical Realism: stressing the domestic “filter” ..... 35
    - 2.2.1 Perceptions/Ideational structure ..... 38
    - 2.2.2 Autonomy ..... 39
  - 2.3 Regional Security Complex Theory: stressing the regional focus..... 40
    - 2.3.1 Definition..... 41
    - 2.3.2 The rationalist-constructivist design ..... 42
    - 2.3.3 Differentiation between the levels..... 43
    - 2.3.4 The concept of regional powers ..... 45
    - 2.3.5 Regional orders..... 47
  - 2.4 Third Worldism: stressing the features of small states domains ..... 49
  - 2.5 Summary ..... 53

<b>3. Research design</b> .....	55
3.1 The most similar systems design.....	55
3.2 Introducing the cases.....	60
3.2.1 The similarity condition .....	61
3.2.2 The difference in outcomes .....	63
3.2.3 The imperfect similarity .....	65
3.2.4 Variables of interest.....	67
3.2.5 Other variables?.....	71
3.3. Analysis of identified variables.....	72
3.4 Fieldwork: interviews with local experts .....	74
3.4.1 Semi-structured qualitative interviews.....	74
3.4.2 Preparation and structure of the interviews.....	74
3.4.3 Profile of the experts .....	75
3.4.4 Briefly on experiences in Uzbekistan.....	77
3.4.5 Briefly on experiences in Tajikistan.....	79
3.5 Summary .....	80
<b>4. Policy of Tajikistan toward Afghanistan</b> .....	83
4.1 Ideational structure .....	84
4.1.1 Ethno-cultural superiority of Tajiks .....	84
4.1.2 The foreign policy concept and the military doctrine .....	89
4.1.3 Tajikistan's view of Afghanistan .....	93
4.1.4 Reflections on Tajikistan's ideational structure .....	98
4.2 The factor of political Islam.....	104
4.2.1 The Islamic Renaissance Party of Tajikistan .....	104
4.2.2 Reflections on the factor of political Islam .....	110
4.3 The factor of ethnicity.....	114
4.3.1 Tajiks .....	115
4.3.2 Tajiks in Afghanistan .....	117
4.3.3 Ahmad Shah Massoud and the Tajik faction .....	119
4.3.4 Tajikistan and Afghanistan.....	124
4.3.5 Reflections on the factor of ethnicity .....	129
4.4 The factor of external actors .....	131
4.4.1 Russia.....	131
4.4.2 The US .....	136
4.4.3 Reflections on the factor of external actors.....	138



<b>5. Policy of Uzbekistan toward Afghanistan</b> .....	141
5.1 Ideational structure.....	142
5.1.1 Ideology of national independence.....	142
5.1.2 The foreign policy concept and the military doctrine .....	149
5.1.3 Uzbekistan’s view of Afghanistan .....	155
5.1.4 Reflections on Uzbekistan’s ideational structure .....	167
5.2 The factor of political Islam.....	170
5.2.1 The Islamic Movement of Uzbekistan .....	171
5.2.2 Reflections on the factor of political Islam .....	175
5.3 The factor of ethnicity.....	176
5.3.1 “Uzbekness” .....	176
5.3.2 Uzbekistan’s Uzbeks .....	179
5.3.3 Afghanistan’s Uzbeks.....	181
5.3.4 Abdul Rashid Dostum .....	183
5.3.5 Uzbekistan and Afghanistan.....	189
5.3.6 Uzbekistan and the Taliban .....	191
5.3.7 Reflections on the factor of ethnicity .....	195
5.4 The factor of external actors .....	198
5.4.1 Russia.....	198
5.4.2 The US .....	208
5.4.3 Reflections on the factor of external actors.....	214
<b>6. Comparison</b> .....	219
6.1 A brief recourse to the theoretical framework .....	219
6.2 Comparing the empirical findings.....	220
6.2.1 Ideational structure .....	220
6.2.2 The factor of political Islam .....	223
6.2.3 The factor of ethnicity .....	224
6.2.4 The factor of external actors.....	228
6.2.5 Comparing expert views.....	229
6.3 Was the identification of variables correct?.....	232
<b>7. Conclusion</b> .....	237
<b>8. Annex</b> .....	247
8.1 List of interview partners .....	247
8.2 Consent paper (sample).....	249
8.3 Tables and maps .....	251
8.4 Bibliography .....	260